

**MINUTES**  
**OF**  
**GLASGOW CITY COUNCIL.**

Glasgow, 27th June 2019.

**Glasgow City Council.**

Present: The Lord Provost, Eva Bolander (Chair).

SAQIB AHMED	JOSEPHINE DOCHERTY	KENNY McLEAN
ADE AIBINU	LAURA DOHERTY	NORMAN MacLEOD
SUSAN AITKEN	STEPHEN DORNAN	ELAINE McSPORRAN
KEN ANDREW	GLENN ELDER	HANZALA MALIK
MALCOLM BALFOUR	MICHELLE FERNS	CHRISTY MEARNS
ELAINE BALLANTYNE	ALLAN GOW	ANGUS MILLAR
DR MARTIN BARTOS	ARCHIE GRAHAM	JON MOLYNEUX
ALEXANDER BELIC	GREG HEPBURN	JANE MORGAN
RICHARD BELL	MHAIRI HUNTER	MANDY MORGAN
EUAN BLOCKLEY	RASHID HUSSAIN	MARGARET MORGAN
PHILIP BRAAT	JOHN KANE	CECILIA O'LONE
MAUREEN BURKE	JIM KAVANAGH	HANIF RAJA
BILL BUTLER	RUAIRI KELLY	MARTIN RHODES
GRAHAM CAMPBELL	ELSPETH KERR	ANNA RICHARDSON
CHRISTINA CANNON	MATT KERR	RUSSELL ROBERTSON
PAUL CAREY	THOMAS KERR	FRANNY SCALLY
ALLAN CASEY	JENNIFER LAYDEN	JAMES SCANLON
ANNETTE CHRISTIE	JOHN LETFORD	SORYIA SIDDIQUE
JAMES COLEMAN	KIM LONG	RHIANNON SPEAR
ROBERT CONNELLY	FRANK McAVEETY	KYLE THORNTON
MICHAEL CULLEN	DAVID McDONALD	MARTHA WARDROP
MALCOLM CUNNING	ELAINE McDOUGALL	ALEX WILSON
CHRIS CUNNINGHAM	MARTIN McELROY	TANYA WISELY
STEPHEN CURRAN	AILEEN McKENZIE	ALLAN YOUNG
FEARGAL DALTON	JACQUELINE McLAREN	

DEACON CONVENER

LORD DEAN OF GUILD

Apology: David Meikle.

Attending: C Forrest, Director of Governance and Solicitor to the Council; A O'Donnell, Chief Executive; M Booth, Executive Director of Finance; G Gillespie, Executive Director of Neighbourhoods and Sustainability; M McKenna, Executive Director of Education Services; and K Rush, Director of Regional Economic Growth.

### **Emergency motion dealt with.**

**1** The Director of Governance and Solicitor to the Council intimated that, in terms of Standing Order No 12(3), an emergency motion by Councillor Matt Kerr regarding the sale of First Glasgow's bus assets, had been delivered to the Chief Executive prior to the meeting.

The Lord Provost having agreed that the motion was relevant, competent and urgent, the House agreed to deal with it at this meeting.

### **Minutes approved.**

**2** The minutes of the Council meeting of 16th May 2019 (Print 2, pages 75 to 91) were submitted and approved.

### **Minutes of committees submitted and approved.**

**3** The minutes of the undernoted committees were submitted and approved:-

- (1) Planning Applications Committee of 21st May 2019 (Print 2, pages 92 to 93);
- (2) Personnel Appeals Committee of 14th and 21st May 2019 (Print 2, page 94);
- (3) Public Processions Committee of 3rd June 2019 (Print 2, page 95);
- (4) City Policy Committees:-
  - (a) General Purposes of 28th May 2019 (Print 2, pages 96 to 97);
  - (b) Wellbeing, Empowerment, Community and Citizen Engagement of 30th May 2019 (Print 2, pages 98 to 100);
  - (c) Neighbourhoods, Housing and Public Realm of 4th June 2019 (Print 2, pages 101 to 104);
  - (d) Education, Skills and Early Years of 6th June 2019 (Print 2, pages 105 to 107); and
  - (d) Environment, Sustainability and Carbon Reduction of 11th June 2019 (Print 2, pages 108 to 110);
- (5) Planning Local Review Committee of 14th and 28th May and 11th June 2019 (Print 2, pages 111 to 112);
- (6) Strathclyde Pension Fund Committee of 5th and 11th June 2019 (Print 2, pages 113 to 117);
- (7) Scrutiny Committees:-

- (a) Operational Performance and Delivery of 22nd May 2019 (Print 2, pages 118 to 120);
- (b) Finance and Audit of 8th May and 12th June 2019 (Print 2, pages 121 to 125); and
- (8) Licensing and Regulatory Committee of 8th, 9th, 22nd and 29th May and 5th 6th and 12th June 2019 (Print 2, pages 126 to 147);
- (9) Contracts and Property Committee of 29th May and 13th June 2019 (Print 2, pages 148 to 154); and
- (10) City Administration Committee of 16th and 30th May and 13th June 2019 (Print 2, pages 155 to 167).

#### **Proposed amendment to Terms of Reference of Committees approved.**

**4** There was submitted a report by Councillor Letford, Council Business Manager and City Convener for Democratic Renewal, seeking approval of amendments to the Terms of Reference of Committees, advising that

- (1) the Council had approved the current Terms of Reference of Committees on 14th September 2017 (Print 3, page 286), following a review of the Council's decision-making arrangements;
- (2) since April 2018 the Business Bureau had been conducting an ongoing review of the decision-making arrangements and the associated procedural documents;
- (3) the current Terms of Reference of Committees only provided for substitutes to be appointed for members of the City Administration Committee and the Business Bureau had agreed to recommend for approval a proposal that these arrangements be extended to all committees of the Council where appropriate;
- (4) it was proposed that the Terms of Reference of Committees be amended to allow committee members to appoint a substitute member from his or her political group to attend a meeting of the committee in his or her place, with the substitute taking part in that meeting with the full powers, duties and responsibilities of a member; and
- (5) any substitutes appointed to committees such as Licensing and Regulatory and Planning Applications would require to undertake training before they were able to take part in meetings of that committee and the Terms of Reference would clearly specify to which committees this would apply.

After consideration, the Council approved the proposed arrangements to allow substitutes to be appointed for committee meetings, as detailed at section 2 of the

report, and the consequential amendments to the Terms of Reference of Committees.

### **Changes to committees approved etc.**

**5** The Council approved the following changes to committees:

<i>Committee etc</i>	<i>Appointment</i>
Contracts and Property Committee	Remove Thomas Kerr and appoint Tony Curtis
Environment, Sustainability and Carbon Reduction City Policy Committee	Remove Malcolm Balfour and appoint Franny Scally
General Purposes City Policy Committee	Remove Elspeth Kerr and appoint Feargal Dalton

### **Representation on outside bodies approved.**

**6** The Council approved the following changes to its representation on outside bodies:-

<i>Organisation</i>	<i>Change</i>
Baillies' Institution	Appoint the Lord Provost, Eva Bolander
City Property (Glasgow) LLP and City Property (Investments) LLP	Remove Tony Curtis and appoint Thomas Kerr
Glasgow Fair Trade Co-operative	Remove Elaine Ballantyne and appoint Michael Cullen
Glasgow Humane Society	Remove Michelle Ferns and appoint Graham Campbell
Royal Incorporation of Hutchesons' Hospital in the City of Glasgow	Appoint Tony Curtis, Glenn Elder and Norman MacLeod as Trustees
Trades House of Glasgow Commonwealth Fund Committee	Appoint Norman MacLeod

### **Correspondence - Letter from Shirley-Anne Sommerville MSP noted.**

**7** With reference to the minutes of 13th December 2018 (Print 6, page 423) approving the terms of a motion in respect of child poverty, there was submitted a

letter from Shirley-Anne Sommerville MSP, Cabinet Secretary for Social Security and Older People in response to that motion.

### **Suspension of Standing Order No 11 (3) agreed.**

**8** The Council agreed to suspend the provisions of Standing Order No 11 (3) in order to allow a question from the new political group, Change Glasgow, to be dealt with.

### **Questions.**

**9** Answers to the following questions, of which notice had been given under Standing Order No 11, were given as undernoted:-

<i>Question</i>	<i>Questioner</i>	<i>Answered by</i>
“To ask the Leader of the Council to comment on the Glasgow Life Golf Courses consultation?”	Councillor Frank McAveety	Councillor David McDonald, Depute Leader of the Council and City Convener Culture, Vibrancy and International Co-operation
“To ask the Leader of the Council to update on the latest discussions with the UK Government following SERCO’s announcement to evict 300 refugees from their homes?”	Councillor Jane Morgan	Councillor Susan Aitken, Leader of the Council and City Convener for Inclusive Economic Growth
“To ask the City Convener for Community Empowerment, Equalities and Human Rights for an update on the evaluation process for the Participatory Budgeting pilots?”	Councillor Martin Rhodes	Councillor Jennifer Layden, City Convener for Community Empowerment, Equalities and Human Rights
“To ask the City Convener for Neighbourhoods, Housing and Public Realm to update the chamber on discussions with the Scottish Government regarding the proposed Planning Bill?”	Councillor Malcolm Cuning	Councillor Kenny McLean, City Convener for Neighbourhoods, Housing and Public Realm
“To ask the Leader of the Council, in relation to John Mason’s comments what proportion of Glasgow’s population are “elites”?”	Councillor Euan Blockley	Councillor Susan Aitken, Leader of the Council and City Convener for Inclusive Economic

		Growth
“To ask the City Convener for Sustainability and Carbon Reduction what measures will be taken to ensure that the failure of the Neighbourhoods service to carry out grass cutting in recent weeks in a timely manner will not be repeated in the future?”	Bailie Kyle Thornton	Councillor Anna Richardson, City Convener for Sustainability and Carbon Reduction
“To ask the relevant City Convener what steps they will take to accelerate the roll-out of 20mph zones in all residential areas in Glasgow after the Scottish Government ignored the wishes of this Council and rejected Mark Ruskell’s Safer Streets Bill?”	Councillor Allan Young	Councillor Anna Richardson, City Convener for Sustainability and Carbon Reduction
“To ask the City Convener for Sustainability and Carbon Reduction which primary schools were in scope and how many children could have benefited this autumn from the Greens “Bike for Every Child” school bike library scheme, had it not been cut in the SNP 2019-20 budget?”	Bailie Dr Martin Bartos	Councillor Anna Richardson, City Convener for Sustainability and Carbon Reduction
“To ask the City Convener for Health and Social Care Integration for a response to the closure of the 3 Sandyford Sexual Health Clinics, which are in some of the most deprived areas of Glasgow?”	Bailie Russell Robertson	Councillor Mhairi Hunter, City Convener for Health and Social Care Integration
“To ask the City Convener for Sustainability and Carbon Reduction for an update of the maintenance arrangements for the Winter Gardens and its surroundings?”	Councillor Robert Connelly	Councillor Kenny McLean, City Convener for Neighbourhoods, Housing and Public Realm
“To ask the City Convener for Workforce for an update on the progress of the Gender Pay Gap Action Plan as agreed at full Council on 4th April 2019?”	Councillor Cecilia O’Lone	Councillor Michelle Ferns, City Convener for Workforce

“Can the Leader of the Council and City Convener for Inclusive Economic Growth update the Chamber on any discussions or actions to improve the city economy since last Council?”

Councillor Laura Doherty

Councillor Susan Aitken, Leader of the Council and City Convener for Inclusive Economic Growth

“To ask the relevant City Convener what steps the Council takes to ensure that plastic waste which it collects for recycling does not end up in unlicensed overseas facilities?”

Councillor Martha Wardrop

Councillor Anna Richardson, City Convener for Sustainability and Carbon Reduction

“To ask the Leader of the Council what assessment has been made of the carbon impact of approved City Deal projects and whether, following Scotland and Glasgow declaring a climate emergency, these projects will be subject to review?”

Councillor Martha Wardrop

Councillor Susan Aitken, Leader of the Council and City Convener for Inclusive Economic Growth

### **Suspension of Standing Order No 5 agreed.**

**10** The Council agreed to suspend the provisions of

- (1) Standing Order No 13(5) to allow additional time for one additional speaker from each political party who wished to speak at item 8(a) on the agenda; and
- (2) Standing Order No 5 (12) and that the House would not adjourn until the notice of motion at item 8(d) on the agenda had been dealt with.

### **Sale of First Glasgow – Motion approved as adjusted.**

**11** With reference to paragraph 1 above, Councillor Matt Kerr, seconded by Bailie Mearns, moved that

“Council notes widespread concern about provision of bus services; the recent announcement by First Group to put its Scottish operations on sale; notes that Aberdeen City Council has instructed its officers to explore options including purchase of First’s Aberdeen bus assets.

Council further notes the petition launched by Get Glasgow Moving on Wednesday, 19th June which has received over 3,500 signatures.

Council therefore instructs the Administration and the Chief Executive to engage with neighbouring local authorities, through the regional transport partnership, and

First Group with a view to preparing an appraisal of options relating to purchase of local bus operational assets; instructs that support is sought from central Government for these proposals; and that a report be provided to the Council's Transport Delivery Steering Group as soon as practical after recess."

Councillor Richardson, seconded by Councillor Aitken, moved as an amendment to delete all after "Scottish operations on sale" and replace with:-

"Council notes that officers have already had initial exploratory discussions with several relevant parties following the First Group announcement. Council notes that officers will expand these discussions and investigate further what the process of acquiring and operating a bus service could involve. Council further notes however that making progress on any such discussions would involve sensitive commercial negotiations. Council therefore resolves to allow officers the necessary space to continue to explore this matter before reporting back to an appropriate committee at a future date, noting that the democratic approval of councillors will determine any decision to proceed.

Ahead of the proposed changes of legislation, negotiations between the City Council and the bus sector will continue around the reliability of services, improving journey times, addressing congestion hot spots, mitigating the disruption created by roadworks and ensuring services can respond quickly to the needs of new city developments."

Councillor Matt Kerr, with the approval of his seconder, accepted part of the amendment by Councillor Richardson, resulting in the following adjusted motion:-

"Council notes widespread concern about provision of bus services; the recent announcement by First Group to put its Scottish operations on sale; notes that officers have already had initial exploratory discussions with several relevant parties following the First Group announcement; notes that officers will expand these discussions, including the regional transport partnership and other national transport partners, and investigate further what the process of acquiring and operating bus operational assets could involve.

Council further notes, however, that making progress on any such discussions would involve sensitive commercial negotiations. Council therefore resolves to allow officers the necessary space to continue to explore this matter before reporting back to the Transport Delivery Steering Group, building on successful examples of working groups in recent months at the earliest opportunity to update on negotiations, noting that the democratic approval of councillors will determine any decision to proceed.

Ahead of the proposed changes of legislation, negotiations between the City Council and the bus sector will continue around the reliability of services, improving journey times, addressing congestion hot spots, mitigating the disruption caused by roadworks and ensuring services can respond quickly to the needs of new city developments."

The adjusted motion was approved unanimously.



**Democratic choice on independence – Motion, as adjusted, approved after division.**

**12** Councillor Aitken, seconded by Councillor Cannon, moved that

“Council welcomes the publication of the Referendums (Scotland) Bill on 29th May and notes that it is expected to complete its parliamentary progress by the end of 2019. Council notes that the bill provides a legal framework for holding referendums on matters that are now, or in future, within the competence of the Scottish Parliament.

Council recalls that, in the 2016 EU Referendum, 67% of the electorate in Glasgow and 62% in Scotland voted to remain in the EU. As such, it condemns the UK Government’s continual bypassing of the views of the Scottish Government and the interests of the people of Scotland; demonstrating that, far from being an equal partner within the UK, Scotland is acknowledged, even on such a critical matter, only if it aligns with that of the UK government.

Council notes with concern the number of candidates vying to succeed Theresa May as UK Prime Minister who are planning for the UK to leave the EU with no deal; an outcome which, it has been estimated by the UK Trade Observatory, would cost Glasgow over 11,000 jobs. Council expressly condemns suggestions that parliament be suspended until after 31st October, the date the UK is scheduled to exit the EU.

Council recognises that, as Scotland is dragged towards the exit door of the EU by a Conservative Government for which we did not vote, and that the promises made by the No Campaign in the 2014 Independence Referendum lie in tatters, citizens in Glasgow and across Scotland are entitled to exercise their right to reject this future through a further referendum on independence.

Council agrees that a future independence referendum should be under the control of the Scottish Parliament and, under the guidance of the Electoral Commission, be fair and open, in line with established best practice, and command public confidence, and instructs the Leader of the Council to write to the Cabinet Secretary for Government Business and Constitutional Relations in support of these principles and of the aims of the Referendums (Scotland) Bill.”

Councillor McAveety, seconded by Councillor Burke, moved as an amendment that

“Council notes the publication of the Referendums (Scotland) Bill on 29th May. Council notes that there has been no significant shift in public opinion in Scotland since the 2014 Scottish Independence Referendum, including no significant shift in demand for a second such referendum. Council believes that the reverse is true for the UK’s referendum to leave the European Union, and reaffirms its commitment to a referendum on the nature of Britain’s exit from the European Union with ‘remain’ as an option.

Council believes that the candidates vying for the Conservative leadership and the Premiership of the United Kingdom do not represent the views of the people of

Glasgow, or Scotland or 58% of people across the United Kingdom who voted in the last General Election. These candidates are set to continue a programme of austerity that has cut at the heart of our communities. The answer to this agenda is one of radical, transformative change which is ultimately only possible by sweeping Conservative Governments out of power.

Council notes the disrespect and borderline contempt demonstrated toward the people of Glasgow, Edinburgh, Newcastle, Manchester, Liverpool, Leeds and Cardiff by the current UK Government; and believes that this is because of the entrenched attitude of successive Conservative Governments.

Council notes its previous decision for a second referendum on the terms of any Brexit deal to be presented to the public, and believes that a 'remain' option in that referendum.

Council welcomes reports that former Labour MEP David Martin has been appointed to lead Scotland's Citizens Assembly; welcomes the calls by former Prime Minister Gordon Brown for a UK-wide Constitutional Convention; and believes that these can provide innovative solutions to the challenges facing the United Kingdom.

Council believes that a prosperous and flourishing Glasgow's future lies in being members of both the United Kingdom and the European Union.  
Council resolves to write to the First Minister in these terms."

Councillor Thomas Kerr, seconded by Bailie Thornton, moved as an amendment that

"Council notes that the people of Scotland voted to remain part of the United Kingdom in the independence referendum of September 2014 and that in the words of the First Minister this was a "once in a generation" vote. Council further notes that the publication of the Referendums (Scotland) Bill on 29th May is a direct contradiction to the 2012 Edinburgh Agreement where both sides pledged to respect the decision of the people of Scotland.

Council therefore believes that the SNP must accept the result of this referendum and abandon their continuous attempts to hold a second independence referendum against the will of the Scottish people. Council further believes that Nicola Sturgeon's obsession with a second independence referendum is more to do with pandering to her party than speaking for the country.

Council expresses its clear opinion that a second independence referendum is not what the people of Glasgow and Scotland want. Council welcomes Scottish Government figures published last year which clearly show that the current devolution settlement, and Barnett Formula that independence would destroy, results in a large fiscal transfer to Scotland from the rest of the United Kingdom with levels of public spending in Scotland of £1,600 per person higher than in the UK as a whole. Council acknowledges analysis by the Institute for Fiscal Studies which shows that the SNP's Sustainable Growth Commission proposals for an independent Scotland would lead to over a decade of cuts to public services in order to reduce a budget deficit of 7.9% of GDP.

Council further notes that the UK single market is over 3 times more valuable to the Scottish economy than the EU single market and that leaving a 300-year-old social, political and economic union with the rest of the UK would risk a hard border between Scotland and its largest trading partners in England, Wales and Northern Ireland. Council therefore believes that the result of the 2016 EU referendum should be honoured and that the United Kingdom should leave the European Union as the people of the United Kingdom (including over one million Scots) voted for and that the SNP should accept the results of both referendums and immediately halt their obsession with breaking up Britain.”

Councillor Molyneux, seconded by Councillor Wardrop, moved as an amendment to insert the following at the end of paragraph 4:-

“Council further recognises that a mandate to request a section 30 order to hold a referendum on independence exists by way of a majority vote of the Scottish Parliament.”

Bailie Robertson, seconded by Bailie Elder, moved as an amendment to delete paragraph 5 and insert the following:-

“Council further notes that Scotland becoming an independent nation should be at the front of our mind, however under the current SNP leadership both in the City Chambers and the Scottish Parliament the cause for our nation’s independence is being damaged by a party leader who has let down the people of Scotland by taking her eye off the ball and a Council Leader who has abandoned her day job.

The Council agree, that a future independence referendum should be for the Scottish Parliament. However, we urge the Leader of this Council to ignore grandstanding calls and get back to her day job, the role of Leader of Glasgow City Council.”

Councillor Aitken, with the agreement of her seconder, accepted the amendment by Councillor Molyneux.

On a vote being taken electronically, 24 members voted for the amendment by Councillor McAveety, 5 for the amendment by Councillor Thomas Kerr, 2 for the amendment by Bailie Robertson and 44 for the motion.

The adjusted motion was accordingly declared to be carried.

## **Adjournment**

**13** The Council, in terms of Standing Order No 17, agreed to adjourn the meeting at 1520 for 10 minutes.

## **Resumption of meeting.**

**14** The meeting resumed at 1530 hours and the sederunt was taken as follows:-

Present: The Lord Provost, Eva Bolander (Chair).

SAQIB AHMED	FEARGAL DALTON	JACQUELINE McLAREN
ADE AIBINU	JOSEPHINE DOCHERTY	KENNY McLEAN
SUSAN AITKEN	LAURA DOHERTY	NORMAN MacLEOD
KEN ANDREW	STEPHEN DORNAN	ELAINE McSPORRAN
MALCOLM BALFOUR	MICHELLE FERNS	HANZALA MALIK
ELAINE BALLANTYNE	ALLAN GOW	ANGUS MILLAR
DR MARTIN BARTOS	ARCHIE GRAHAM	JON MOLYNEUX
ALEXANDER BELIC	GREG HEPBURN	JANE MORGAN
RICHARD BELL	MHAIRI HUNTER	MANDY MORGAN
EUAN BLOCKLEY	RASHID HUSSAIN	MARGARET MORGAN
PHILIP BRAAT	JOHN KANE	CECILIA O'LONE
MAUREEN BURKE	JIM KAVANAGH	HANIF RAJA
BILL BUTLER	RUAIRI KELLY	MARTIN RHODES
GRAHAM CAMPBELL	ELSPETH KERR	ANNA RICHARDSON
CHRISTINA CANNON	MATT KERR	RUSSELL ROBERTSON
PAUL CAREY	THOMAS KERR	FRANNY SCALLY
ALLAN CASEY	JENNIFER LAYDEN	JAMES SCANLON
ANNETTE CHRISTIE	JOHN LETFORD	SORYIA SIDDIQUE
JAMES COLEMAN	KIM LONG	RHIANNON SPEAR
ROBERT CONNELLY	FRANK McAVEETY	KYLE THORNTON
MICHAEL CULLEN	DAVID McDONALD	MARTHA WARDROP
MALCOLM CUNNING	ELAINE McDOUGALL	ALEX WILSON
CHRIS CUNNINGHAM	MARTIN McELROY	TANYA WISELY
STEPHEN CURRAN	AILEEN McKENZIE	ALLAN YOUNG

DEACON CONVENER

LORD DEAN OF GUILD

Apology: David Meikle.

Attending: C Forrest, Director of Governance and Solicitor to the Council; A O'Donnell, Chief Executive; M Booth, Executive Director of Finance; G Gillespie, Executive Director of Neighbourhoods and Sustainability; and K Rush, Director of Regional Economic Growth.

## **Tenement Tax – Motion dealt with, after division.**

**15** Councillor McElroy, seconded by Councillor O'Lone, moved that

“Council notes that there are over 1,000 closes in this city that have alternative arrangements for presenting bins at the kerbside, agreed between Housing Associations and the Council. These arrangements generally involve private

contractors, contracted by the Housing Association, performing the job previously performed by Glasgow City Council employees. Council further notes that these arrangements have been dubbed the Tenement Tax, including in the campaign by the GMB union.

Council believes that the use of innovative solutions to long standing problems should be explored. In some cases, it is entirely appropriate that the Council protect the health and safety of staff involved in collecting refuse.

However, Council believes that, in the majority of cases, this practice simply passes on the cost of presentation to Housing Associations and their residents, who already pay Council Tax in expectation of this service being provided.

Therefore, the Tenement Tax amounts to privatisation by the 'close' door, and is the result of ever growing pressures on staff time and resources, exacerbated by the Scottish Government's continued real-terms cuts to Glasgow City Council's core budget.

Council therefore resolves that the Tenement Tax should be scrapped."

Councillor Richardson, seconded by Councillor Wardrop, moved as an amendment to delete all after the first sentence and insert:-

"Council further notes that such arrangements have been in place since 2004 and reflect partnership working between the city's housing associations and the Council, designed to provide the best possible service to residents and to address concerns over working conditions raised by the GMB on behalf of their members in some parts of the city.

Council welcomes the significant investment being put in place by the Council through the bin replacement programme and the change to service delivery through the new Neighbourhood Model and considers that these provide a firm base from which to build a better refuse service for residents in the city's tenemental properties and to provide the best working conditions for the Council's employees.

Council believes that the use of innovative solutions to long standing problems within tenements should be explored as part of the Bin Replacement Programme and signing up to the Household Recycling Charter. This should include consideration of underground systems of waste containment which is becoming increasingly common in modern European cities.

Council commits itself to continue working closely with its employees, local residents, and property managers across the city, including RSLs, to identify solutions that respond to local concerns, creating the quality of neighbourhoods the city's residents deserve.

Council welcomes the recommendations of the Working Group on Tenement Maintenance Scheme Property which covers building inspections, owners' associations and Building Reserve Funds. Council agrees that the suggestions of

this Working Group to improve the fabric of Glasgow's tenements, as well as associated bin shelters and commonly-owned back courts and lanes, are considered alongside Council investment priorities and this is reported to the relevant policy development committee during 2019-2020."

Bailie Aibinu, seconded by Councillor Connelly, moved as an amendment to delete from paragraph 3 onwards and replace with:-

"Council notes that in the majority of cases that this practice passes on the cost of presentation to Housing Associations and their residents who already pay Council Tax for this service. Council believes that any such move to ask residents to pay directly or indirectly for this service via their Housing Association or Factor must be done only where a majority of residents in a close agree to do so.

Council notes that this change in practice is as a result of growing pressures on staff time and resources, exacerbated by the Scottish Government's continued real-terms cuts to Glasgow City Council's core budget.

Council resolves that a report should be brought to the Environment and Sustainability Committee within 3 months of this motion setting out where this practice takes place, the reasons why it has been introduced, if residents were consulted and agreed to this prior to its introduction and what options are available to stop this practice occurring if that is the wish of this Council".

On a vote being taken electronically 43 members voted for the amendment by Councillor Richardson, 5 for the amendment by Bailie Aibinu and 25 for the motion.

The amendment by Councillor Richardson was accordingly declared to be carried.

### **Social Mobility Pledge – Motion dealt with, after division.**

**16** Councillor Thomas Kerr, seconded by Bailie Thornton, moved that

"Council notes the importance of social mobility and equality of opportunity in removing the barriers to aspiration and achievement faced by those from our deprived communities.

Council appreciates the work of Justine Greening MP in launching the Social Mobility Pledge, which represents a commitment from businesses and other employers to improve social mobility by signing up to the following three steps:-

- (1) partner with schools or colleges to provide coaching through quality careers advice, enrichment experience and/or mentoring to people from disadvantaged backgrounds or circumstances;
- (2) provide structured work experience and/or apprenticeship opportunities to people from disadvantaged backgrounds or circumstances; and

- (3) adopt open employee recruitment practices which promote a level playing field for people from disadvantaged backgrounds or circumstances.

Council notes that Glasgow is already undertaking significant work which aligns with the aims of the Social Mobility Pledge. Council recognises that, by committing to the Pledge and becoming an accredited organisation, it will seek to continue this work and further demonstrate the Council's commitment to accessing and progressing talent from all backgrounds.

Council therefore resolves to join with Wandsworth Borough Council and Milton Keynes Council, as well as employers ranging from Morrisons to ITV and Manchester United FC, in committing to the Social Mobility Pledge and becoming a Pledge accredited employer. It further calls on other Glasgow employers, as well as local authorities throughout Scotland, to join this Council in signing up to the Social Mobility Pledge."

Councillor Long, seconded by Councillor Ferns, moved as an amendment that

"Council notes that social and economic inequalities result from structural imbalances in power and privilege. Council notes that UK government policy is responsible for at best failing to address and at worst deepening inequality, including between disabled and non-disabled citizens due to 'fit for work' testing, between richer and poorer citizens due to austerity and the punitive sanctions regime, and between people with citizenship and those seeking refugee protection due to the Hostile Environment.

Council therefore rejects the falsehood that social mobility can be addressed in an individualistic manner, such as that which is promoted through the Social Mobility Pledge.

Council notes that to tackle poverty and promote social justice, policies cutting across a wide range of areas need to be considered together, including employment support, welfare, housing, early years provision and education, public health and family support.

Council notes that childcare, pupil support and the living wage are being taken forward by the Council in partnership with the Scottish Government. Council further notes that the report recognises Scotland is becoming more socially mobile, with a person's socio-economic status less determined by their parents' socio-economic status.

Council applauds that the Scottish Government has introduced a legal requirement on public bodies aimed at reducing socio-economic disadvantage, and that Scotland has the lowest child poverty rate in Great Britain.

Council invites Justine Greening MP to visit Glasgow again, after her visit to St Roch's Secondary in August 2018, and learn further how by being a Living Wage Employer, providing a "Fair Work Fund" and investing in our children and young people's future, social justice in Glasgow and other local authorities and across the UK can be improved.

Council resolves to continue to work hard to counter inequality by structural measures such as supporting progressive taxation, promoting universal basic income as an alternative social security system, and rejecting and dismantling social structures which maintain elites and privilege where it can, as well as investing in community development and asset-based regeneration which enable communities to develop locally-led collective solutions to overcome inequality.”

On a vote being taken electronically 65 members voted for the amendment and 5 for the motion.

The amendment was accordingly declared to be carried.

### **Economic strategy – Motion, as adjusted, approved after division.**

**17** Councillor Molyneux, seconded by Councillor Long, moved that

“Council notes that its strategic plan aims to support inclusive economic growth and understands that work is underway to develop ways of measuring and articulating that better. Council believes this work is urgent in light of the recent Poverty and Inequality Commission report which concluded that very little has changed in how the inclusive economic growth agenda is being delivered since it became national policy 4 years ago.

Council understands there is growing consensus that GDP and other economic output measures are inherently inadequate due to their failure to reflect economic inequality, human wellbeing or environmental impacts, and their prioritisation of private riches over public wealth.

Council commends the work of the Wellbeing International Alliance and others who are advancing alternatives to GDP and notes that New Zealand - one of the comparator economies for Scotland highlighted in the Growth Commission report - has started to embrace wellbeing economics and has published what has been described as the world’s first wellbeing budget.

Council further understands that the climate and ecological crises highlight the urgent need for economies to adapt so they function within finite planetary limits.

Council believes there is a compelling case to consider how concepts of wellbeing economics and degrowth can inform the city’s future economic strategy and therefore resolves to create a cross party working group to take evidence from appropriate experts and report back to an appropriate committee within the current calendar year.”

Councillor Millar, seconded by Councillor Aitken, moved as an amendment to delete the first paragraph after “inclusive economic growth” and replace with:-

“and welcomes the significant amount of work undertaken so far, including the development of an inclusive growth diagnostic for Glasgow, which informed the



recently agreed Inclusive Growth Programme, containing actions including: the prioritisation of Fair Work initiatives, focusing on areas such as the Living Wage and in-work progression; the establishment of a Social Enterprise Growth Accelerator; the appointment of a Public Health Officer to support a medium to long term delivery plan to address the city's endemic health inequalities; and a refresh of the Glasgow Guarantee to ensure it meets inclusive growth ambitions. Council believes that work such as this is placing Glasgow in the vanguard of UK local authorities who are translating thinking about inclusive economic models, focused on reducing inequality and promoting wellbeing, into practical implementation and delivery.

and to delete the final paragraph and replace with:-

“Council notes that work on a refresh of the city's Economic Strategy is well underway, with an updated strategy to be published by the end of 2019; and further notes that this will prioritise an inclusive growth economy, Fair Work, reducing inequality and environmental sustainability.

Council further notes that a new joint Public Health strategy, aiming to increase citizen wellbeing and deliver sustainable reduction in inequalities in health, morbidity and life expectancy in Glasgow, will be published in early autumn and will also underpin the new Economic Strategy. Council instructs the Chief Executive to ensure that the work of the Wellbeing Economy Alliance and other thinking in this field, including adopting alternatives to GDP/GVA, is also fully considered embedded in the development of this overall programme of work.”

Councillor Blockley, seconded by Councillor Connelly moved as an amendment to delete from paragraph 3 to the end and replace with:-

“Council understands that there are a range of different economic indicators which are available including measures in regards to wellbeing. Council further believes that using a range of available evidence including both GDP and wellbeing indicators can enrich public policy and help to refine measures to bring about economic growth.

Council believes that this Council should consider the alternative economic growth measures available and a report should be brought to the appropriate committee in the near future setting out how these measures can be utilised alongside GDP to improve policies supporting inclusive economic growth.”

Councillor Molyneux, with the approval his seconder, accepted the amendment by Councillor Millar.

On a vote being taken electronically 4 members voted for the amendment by Councillor Blockley and 65 for the motion as adjusted, which was accordingly declared to be carried.

## **Adjournment**

**18** In terms of Standing Order No 5(12), the time being after 1700 hours, the Council agreed to adjourn the meeting at 1730 hours, the remaining items of business being 8(e) and 8(f).